Human Trafficking and the Healthcare Professional

Jeff Barrows, D.O., M.A. (Bioethics)
Founder
Gracehaven
Educational Objectives

At the conclusion of this presentation, attendees will be able to:

◼ Articulate the scope, presentation(s), and health effects of human trafficking.

◼ Identify indicators of possible human trafficking among patients, including risk factors and other signs.

◼ Describe the barriers within health care that prevent health care professionals from recognizing victims of human trafficking.

◼ Recognize the importance of protocol development in properly responding to victims of human trafficking within the health care setting.
No Commercial or Conflict of Interest to Declare
16-year-old female named Jill is brought into the ER by her brother with a chief complaint of moderate vaginal bleeding.

Brother states bleeding “hasn’t been much”…but unsure when it started
Case Presentation- Jill

- Jill appears pale and needs assistance to stand.
- The triage nurse is immediately notified, and Jill and her brother are brought back into an exam room.
Case Presentation - Jill

- Upon questioning, Jill’s brother does all the talking.
- He states that Jill was doing just fine until about 2 hours ago.
- When she began to show signs of blood loss, he brought her immediately into the ER.
Case Presentation - Jill

- He adds the following:
  - 2 years prior, their parents were killed in an automobile accident
  - Since that time, Jill has been suffering from schizophrenia and various delusions.
  - For that reason, he is Jill’s full time caregiver.
Case Presentation - Jill

- Physical exam and lab revealed the following:
  - Pregnancy test is +
  - Uterus about 12-14 weeks
  - Signs of trauma at the cervix
  - Brisk bleeding through the cervical os
  - Hemoglobin is 7
Case Presentation- Jill

- Physical exam and lab revealed the following:
  - Scar across her neck
  - Scars on her wrists and ankles
Case Presentation - Jill

- Clinical course
  - Given several units of packed cells
  - Taken to OR for D & C
  - Stabilized over 2 days
  - Discharged to home with Bruce her brother.
Case Presentation - Jill

True situation:

- Jill is a 16-year-old runaway
- Bruce is not her brother...a trafficker who:
  - Tricked her into coming home with him
  - Beat and raped her until she agreed to work as a prostitute in his basement
Case Presentation- Jill

True situation:

- Jill has been living under the control of Bruce since she was 14
- She became pregnant
- Bruce attempted an illegal abortion
- Brought her to ER when bleeding became severe
Case Presentation- Jill

True situation:

- Not discovered until much later when police raided Bruce’s home for drugs
- Found Jill tied up…naked in a closet
- Significant emotional problems
Case Presentation- Jill

True situation:

- Jill was not yet 18 years old!
Human Trafficking:
Legal Definition

Derived from federal legislation entitled:

The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000

TVPA
United States - TVPA
To be convicted of HT

Action:
- Recruiting
- Harboring
- Transporting
- Providing
- Obtaining
- Patronizing
- Soliciting

Means:
- Force
- Fraud
- Coercion

Purpose:
- Sexual Exploitation
- OR
- Labor exploitation

Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act of 2015
One Exception:
Minor <18 in commercial sex

Action:
- Recruiting
- Enticing
- Harboring
- Transporting
- Providing
- Obtaining
- Maintaining
- Patronizing
- Soliciting
- Advertising (Knowingly)

Means:
- Force
- Fraud
- Coercion

Purpose:
- Sexual Exploitation

Justice for Victims of Trafficking Act of 2015
Ohio Law- 2905.32
Adult (≥18)

Act or attempt to:
- Recruit
- Lure
- Entice
- Harbor
- Transport
- Provide
- Obtain
- Maintain

Purpose:
- Subjected: Involuntary servitude
- Compelled*: Sexual activity for hire, Sexual performance, Production of obscene material

*Compulsion does not need to be openly displayed or physically exerted. Compulsion is established if victims will is overcome by force, fear, duress, intimidation or fraud.
Ohio Law- 2905.32
<16 years old or DD

Act or attempt:
- Recruit
- Lure
- Entice
- Harbor
- Transport
- Provide
- Obtain
- Maintain

Purpose:
- Subjected:
  - Involuntary servitude

- Compelled:
  - Sexual activity for hire
  - Sexual performance
  - Production of obscene material

KNOWINGLY
Ohio Law- 2905.32
16-17 years old

Act or attempt:
- Recruit
- Lure
- Entice
- Harbor
- Transport
- Provide
- Obtain
- Maintain

Purpose:
- Subjected: Involuntary servitude
- Compelled: Sexual activity for hire, Sexual performance, Production of obscene material

And:
- Certain relationship of authority from 2907.03

KNOWINGLY
Ohio Law- 2905.32
16-17 years old
Offender is:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parent</th>
<th>Stepparent</th>
<th>Guardian</th>
<th>Custodian</th>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>Coach or other person in authority in school</th>
<th>Supervisory or disciplinary authority over victim</th>
<th>Scout leader</th>
<th>Medical or mental health professional</th>
<th>Cleric</th>
<th>Detention facility worker</th>
<th>Peace officer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Human Trafficking

- Sexual Exploitation
- Labor Exploitation
Human Trafficking

Sex Trafficking

Labor Trafficking
Human Trafficking

- International Victims
- Domestic Victims
Human Trafficking

- International Victims
  - Sex Trafficking
  - Labor Trafficking
- Domestic Victims
  - Sex Trafficking
  - Labor Trafficking
Human Trafficking

- International Victims
  - Sex Trafficking
  - Labor Trafficking

- Domestic Victims
  - Sex Trafficking
  - Labor Trafficking

Most Common
Human Trafficking

- International Victims
  - Sex Trafficking
  - Labor Trafficking
- Domestic Victims
  - Sex Trafficking
  - Labor Trafficking

Minors

- Child Sex Trafficking (CST)
- Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking (DMST)
- Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children (CSEC)
Human Trafficking vs. Smuggling

Transnational Human Trafficking

- Is a crime against a person

- Once the border is crossed, the person is placed into either labor or sex exploitation

Human Smuggling

- Is a crime against a country’s borders

- Once the border is crossed, those smuggled are free to leave
Prevalence of Human Trafficking

Existing data based on calculated estimates, not actual counts
Global Estimates of Modern Slavery 2017

International Labour Office

WALK FREE FOUNDATION

In partnership with

International Organization for Migration (IOM)
The UN Migration Agency
Total of 40.3 Million People Enslaved

Modern Slavery

- Forced Marriage: 15,400,000 (38%)
- Forced labor: 24,900,000 (62%)

In total: 40,300,000

ILO 2017
Worldwide Scope - 24.9 Million

Forced Labor

- State Imposed Labor, 4,100,000 (17%)
- Sex Trafficking 4,800,000
- Labor Trafficking 16,000,000 (64%)

- Male 29%
- Female 71%

- Minor 25%
- Adult 75%

ILO 2017
Ohio Trafficking Estimates

Williamson et al. (2010)
Ohio Trafficking Estimates
2014-2016

Known Victims: 1032
At-Risk Individuals: 4209

Anderson et. al. (2019)
Worldwide Scope of Trafficking

$150 Billion Profit each year from human trafficking

Profits and Poverty: The Economics of Forced Labor. ILO 2014
International Trafficking within the U.S.
International Trafficking

Sex Trafficking = Labor Trafficking
Number of foreign victims trafficked into the U.S.

- Exact number unknown
- Most estimates are in the thousands
- NHTRC reports 8757 foreign national victims from 2007-2016
Location of Potential Trafficking Cases

National Human Trafficking Resource Center 2018
Top 5 Countries of Origin

1. Mexico
2. China
3. Philippines
4. Guatemala
5. Honduras

NHTRC 2016
Push/Pull Factors - International

- Conflict
- Lack of Support
- Instability
- Poverty
International labor trafficking venues:

- **Domestic servants**
- **Factories**
- **Janitorial jobs**
- **Construction sites**
- **Restaurants**
- **Hotels**
- **Farm work**
International Sex Trafficking Venues:

- Strip/topless clubs
- Asian massage parlors
- Online escorts
- Latino brothels
- Major sporting events
International Traffickers: The Profile

- Sophisticated
- National, international networks
- Organized crime syndicates
Domestic Trafficking

Trafficking of U.S. Citizens
Domestic Trafficking

Sex Trafficking > Labor Trafficking
If a girl enters prostitution prior to age 18...average age is 13!

Williamson et. al. (2012)
Push/Pull Factors - Domestic

- Lack of awareness
- Normalization
- System Involved
- Instability
- Abuse/Neglect
So why is this such a HUGE problem?

Money!

Average girl will make between $500 to $1000 per day selling sex
Recruitment - Gorilla Pimp

- Tricks the girl into coming with him through lies
- Uses brutal force and threats to control her
- Less common type of trafficker
Recruitment- Finesse Pimp

- **Stage 1-Initial Contact**
  - Internet
  - Malls
- **Stage 2- Seduction**
- **Stage 3- Increasing control**
- **Stage 4- Separation**
- **Stage 5- Trauma bonding**
“You promise a girl heaven, and she’ll follow you to hell”

Quote from a trafficker
Sex Trafficking vs. Prostitution

- All minors <18 are victims under federal law
- Majority of adult women work under circumstances that would fall under force, fraud, or coercion
- Only minority of prostitution is truly consensual
Domestic Sex Trafficking Venues:

- Street prostitution
- Strip/topless clubs
- Massage parlors
- Online escorts
- Truck stops
- Major sporting events
Where are the girls/women sold?

Internet

- Backpage
- Craig’s List
- Eros.com
- Facebook
- My Space
- Apps
Male Victims

- Under-recognized
- Victims of both labor and sex trafficking
- Commercially exploited males are perceived as less likely to be under the control of a trafficker
Role of Healthcare Professionals

Finding and Caring for victims of human trafficking
All types of HT victims and healthcare

- 68% were seen by a health care professional while being trafficked

Chisolm-Straker et. al. (2016)
Barriers to identification - Lack of self-identification

- Fear of trafficker
- Fear of deportation
- Lack of understanding of system
- Provider ignorance of trafficking
- Emotional trauma bonding
- Don’t identify as victims
- HCP Bias
- Shame/Guilt
Where victims are seen for healthcare

- Emergency/Urgent: 56%
- Primary Care: 44%
- Dentist: 27%
- Ob/Gyn: 26%
- Alternative: 9%
- Other: 5%
- Pediatrician: 3%

Chisolm-Straker et al. (2016)
Presenting complaint-
All types of HT victims and healthcare

- Physical abuse: 66%
- Depression: 65%
- Headache: 45%
- Back pain: 42%

Chisolm-Straker et. al. (2016)
Physical Health Consequences

- Physical injuries
  - Burns, fractures, cuts, bruises
- STI’s/PID
- Unwanted pregnancies
- Unsafe abortions
- Worsening chronic health conditions

Macias-Konstantopoulos et. al. (2015) & Ravi et. al. (2017)
Mental Health Consequences

- Depression
- Anxiety
- PTSD
- Suicidal ideation
- Substance abuse

Macias-Konstantopoulos et al. (2015)
How to Identify and Treat Victims of Trafficking
How might a victim present?

I’m a Trafficking Victim.
3 Categories of Indicators

- Indicators of control
- Strange Red Flags
- Physical Indicators
Indicators of Control

- Other person with them may claim or actually be their boyfriend, uncle, husband, brother, sister, mom or dad.

- Person controls conversation
  - Corrects the patient
  - Person does not allow the patient to answer questions

- Person doesn’t want to leave
Indicators of Control

- Patient may exhibit body language displaying:
  - Fear
  - Anger
  - Anxiety
  - Submission

- Not in control of ID documents

- Not in control of money

- Avoids eye contact
Indicators of Control

- If alone, may exhibit the following:
  - Frequent texting
  - Phone calls during or after exam
  - Appear in a hurry or unwarranted anxiety
Suspicious Red Flags

- Large amount of cash
- Patient doesn’t know what city he/she is in
- Patient unable to give address
- Doesn’t know how to get home
- Patient appears to be lying about age
Suspicious Red Flags

- Absent official documents
- Access to money and goods inconsistent with age
- Youth not living with parents
- Youth not attending school
Suspicious Red Flags

- Patient is a very poor historian
- History keeps changing or inconsistent
- All the pieces do not seem to fit together
- Do you get the feeling you’re not getting the whole story
- Late presentation
Physical Indicators - International

- Psychological stress, PTSD, evidence of substance abuse
- Dental trauma
- Lack of Immunization
- GI Somatic complaints
- STI's including HIV/AIDS
- Sleep deprivation
- Malnutrition
- Tuberculosis
- Physical trauma such as burns
- Evidence of sexual trauma
- Atopic skin rashes

Konstonopolous et al. (2013)
Physical Indicators - Domestic

- Psychological stress, PTSD, evidence of substance abuse
- Dental trauma
- GI Somatic complaints
- STI’s including HIV/AIDS
- Highly abnormal pap
- Frequent need for pregnancy test
- Sleep deprivation
- Weight loss
- Physical trauma such as burns
- Evidence of sexual trauma
- Tattoos signifying “property of”
Tattoo’s
6 Question Screening Tool for CST

- Is there a previous hx of drug and/or alcohol use?
- Has the youth ever run away from home?
- Has the youth ever been involved with LE?
- Has the youth ever broken a bone, had a traumatic loss of consciousness, or sustained a significant wound?
- Has the youth ever had an STI?
- Does the youth have a hx of > 5 sexual partners?
Screened 203 participants in a pediatric ED

Found 100 positive screens (2+ positive answers)

Eventually identified 11 CST victims

  10 of the 11 had screened positive

91% sensitivity; 53% specificity; 10% PPV; 99% NPV

Kaltiso et. al. (2018)
HHS Human Trafficking Screening Toolkit

Adult Human Trafficking Screening Tool and Guide

A guide for training public health, behavioral health, health care, and social work professionals who wish to use trauma-informed and survivor-informed practices to assess adult clients and patients for human trafficking victimization or risk of potential trafficking victimization.

January 2018

What do you do if your suspicions increase after the exam?
To respond properly, you need to prepare in advance
PROTOCOL TOOLKIT
for Developing a Response to
Victims of Human Trafficking in Health Care Settings

https://healtrafficking.org/linkagesresources/protocol-toolkit/
What if no protocol?

Until a protocol is in place, my recommendations for response are:

- Treat the medical problems
- Do not attempt to intervene
- Report suspected cases to NHTRC
  - 888-3737-888 or text 233733
- Report suspicions of danger to HT trained LE official
Elements of a response protocol

- Local trafficking indicators
- Separation procedures
- Interview procedures
- Forensic examination procedures
- Intervention procedures
- Reporting procedures
- Follow up procedures
Separate the Patient from the Potential Trafficker
Clear separation procedure

- When to do the separation
  - With a physical examination
  - With a purported X-ray or UA

- Words to say

- Who is to do the separation

- What to do if the person refuses to leave
Interview procedures

- If the patient is a victim of trafficking, they are probably highly traumatized, requiring:
  - Trauma-informed staff to establish trust
  - Staff to take whatever time possible

Hemmings et. al. (2016)
How to discuss sex trafficking with a potential victim.
Trauma Informed Care (TIC)

1. Safety
2. Trustworthiness/transparency
3. Peer support/mutual self-help
4. Collaboration/mutuality
5. Empowerment/voice/choice
6. Cultural/historical/gender issues

SAMHSA (2014)
Interview procedures

- Trauma-informed personnel to consider:
  - Hospital social worker
  - SANE/SAFE nurse
  - Specially trained trauma nurse

- Provide translation as necessary
  - Use professional interpreters
  - Never use “family” members

Hemmings et. al. (2016)
Interview procedures

- Sit at eye level
- Make sure immediate needs are met (food, water)
- Maintain eye contact
- Use open ended questions
International Human Trafficking: Questions

- What are your working or living conditions like?
- Where do you sleep and eat?
- Do you have to ask permission to eat, sleep or go to the bathroom?
- Is there a lock on your door or windows so you cannot get out?
International Human Trafficking: Questions

- Can you leave your work or job situation if you want?
- When you are not working, can you come and go as you please?
- Have you been threatened with harm if you try to quit?
- Has anyone threatened your family?
Domestic Human Trafficking: Questions

- Where are you living now and with whom?
- Do you go to school?
- Do you have a boyfriend/girlfriend? How old?
- Are you sexually active? How many partners in the past 6 months?
- Is anyone pushing you to do something you don’t want to do?
Domestic Human Trafficking: Questions

- Have you been asked to have sex with multiple men each night?
- Do you have to meet a quota of money before you can safely return home?
- Has someone forced you to perform sexually before a camera?
- Has anyone taken sexually suggestive photo’s of you to post on the Internet?
Terms to Avoid:

- Coercion
- Sex worker
- Prostitution
- Trafficking
- Call girl
- Escort
- Pimp
Strategy for working with minors

- Preparing a minor for mandatory reporting?
- Do you explain the limits of confidentiality when talking with minors?
- What do you do with a minor who refuses intervention?
HIPAA

From 2013 update on HIPAA from HHS:

CFR 164.512 (j)

(1) Permitted disclosures. A covered entity may, consistent with applicable law and standards of ethical conduct, use or disclose protected health information, if the covered entity, in good faith, believes the use or disclosure:

(i)(A) Is necessary to prevent or lessen a serious and imminent threat to the health or safety of a person or the public; and

(B) Is to a person or persons reasonably able to prevent or lessen the threat, including the target of the threat;
ICD-10: Suspected Trafficking

Under Adult and child abuse, neglect and other maltreatment, suspected

- T76.5 – Forced sexual exploitation, suspected
- T76.51 – Adult forced sexual exploitation, suspected
- T76.52 – Child sexual exploitation, suspected
- T76.6 – Forced labor exploitation, suspected
- T76.61 – Adult forced labor exploitation, suspected
- T76.62 – Child forced labor exploitation, suspected
ICD-10: Confirmed Trafficking

Under Adult and child abuse, neglect and other maltreatment, confirmed

- T74.5 – Forced sexual exploitation, confirmed
- T74.51 – Adult forced sexual exploitation, confirmed
- T74.52 – Child sexual exploitation, confirmed
- T74.6 – Forced labor exploitation, confirmed
- T74.61 – Adult forced labor exploitation, confirmed
- T74.62 – Child forced labor exploitation, confirmed
Z codes for examination of HT victim

Under Encounter for examination and observation for other reasons

- Z04.81 - Encounter for examination and observation of victim following forced sexual exploitation
- Z04.82 - Encounter for examination and observation of victim following forced labor exploitation

Under Problems related to upbringing: Personal history of abuse in childhood

- Z62.813 - Personal history of forced labor or sexual exploitation in childhood

Under Personal risk factors, not elsewhere classified: Personal history of psychological trauma, not elsewhere classified

- Z91.42 - Personal history of forced labor or sexual exploitation
References


References


References
